
SAFETY POLICIES AND DOMESTIC ROAD TRANSPORT: IMPLICATIONS FOR SUSTAINABLE DOMESTIC TOURISM IN NIGERIA

¹Chinonye Emelia Kayode; ²Nnaemeka Daniel Agbasiere & ^{*3}Elochukwu A. Nwankwo

^{1&3}Department of Archaeology and Tourism University of Nigeria, Nsukka

²National Institute for Hospitality and Tourism (NIHOTOUR), Abuja

*Corresponding author: elochukwu.nwankwo@unn.edu.ng

Abstract

Road traffic crashes have undermined the contributions of domestic road transportation to tourism development in Nigeria. Despite the availability of road transport policies, there is still incessant road traffic crashes in Nigeria according to the FRSC report and previous studies. This has raised questions on the compliance level with road traffic policies in Nigeria. The study adopted a qualitative method of study where approaches like key informant interviews, focus group discussion and observation were used to investigate the compliance level of road transport policies among commercial road transport companies in Nigeria, with a view to promoting sustainable domestic tourism in Nigeria. Cluster, purposive and convenient sampling techniques aided the selection of 39 commercial road transport companies and 117 key informants. The compliance level was measured using three distinctive paradigms of 'Low, Moderate and High', in addition to simple percentages. The result of the study shows that there is an average compliance level to road transport policies in Nigeria amongst various commercial road transport companies. This has implications for sustainable domestic tourism in Nigeria. It is expected that the study would have addressed fundamental safety issues in domestic road transport for sustainable domestic tourism development in Nigeria.

Keywords: *Travelers Safety; Domestic tourism; Domestic transport; Road traffic policy; Compliance level; Commercial transporters*

Introduction

Most developing tourist destinations have been characterised by huge domestic transport demand (Joewono & Kubuta, 2006). This is because the motivation for domestic tourist attractions and tourism potentialities are derived initially from domestic mobility through international attendance (Page, 2009; Nwankwo, 2017). In the Nigerian case, domestic tourism has a major boost to the nation's growing tourism industry and hence demands attention. For instance, in 2013 Mrs Sally Mbanefo who was the then Director General of the Nigerian Tourism Development Corporation (NTDC), revealed that "...Nigeria has about US\$4 billion domestic tourist market with the diaspora market estimated at US \$3billion annually (Babatunde, 2014). Moreover, the Director further gave a statistical representation of domestic and international tourism in Nigeria by revealing that in 2013 the Osun Oshogbo festival had in attendance 21, 713 domestic tourists and 123 International tourists with ₦58,230,170 as the recorded expenditure. He also asserts that the Abuja carnival of that same year (2013) had 19,015 domestic tourists and 113 international tourists with ₦147,385,250 as the recorded expenditure from these groups of

tourists in Nigeria (Babatunde, 2014). In addition, Mrs Mbanefo reiterated that with the right environment and approach, the nation can boost its GDP significantly through tourist flow; hence the estimation is targeted at US \$4 billion and US \$3 billion for domestic and international tourist markets respectively (Babatunde, 2014).

In 2017, Foturunsho Folarin-Coker, the Current Director General of the Nigerian Tourism Development Corporation (NTDC) noted in strong terms that domestic tourism has really boosted the nation's tourism industry with a significant contribution to the nation's GDP. He went further to note that the agency would focus more on the nation's domestic tourism through various promotional programmes like the tagging Tour Nigeria and others. The Director further noted that Nigerian Tourism Development Cooperation (NTDC) as a federal agency will partner strongly with some other federal agencies like the Niger Delta Development Commission, and other relevant agencies in harnessing the potentialities of domestic tourism in Nigeria (Ojo, 2017). In a similar development, the Director General of NTDC noted that he has strategic plans to redefine the nation's tourism sector with greater emphasis on domestic tourism which generates more than 60% of the nation's tourism receipts. He also asserts that agencies like National Association of Nigerian Travel Agents (NANTA) would play a great role in the partnership for the actualisation of this task (Olaitan, 2017).

However, domestic tourism and its viabilities to tourism development in most nations, more especially the developing nations, has been identified as an integral part of the tourism industry. In Nigeria for example, there are many individuals, institutions and government-owned tourism resources that have not only generated revenue but equally motivated various domestic movements within the various states of the federation both for Nigerians and non-Nigerians who visited the nation for either tourism purposes or any other purpose (Onuoha, 2012). Also, the Nigerian Cultural Policy of 1988 is also part of the domestic tourism motivation in the country through one of its major mandates to encourage and motivate movements within the nation amongst Nigerians.

Domestic transport has been identified as another main thrust for domestic tourism after the notable tourism resources. Many studies have identified domestic transport as the major aspect of the transport industry that generates over 70% of the total receipts from the transport sector of any nation (e.g. Jennissen, Harland, Wetzen, Hoogerwerf, O'Donnell, & Denning, 2017; Mohan, 2002; O'Neill & Mohan, 2002; Kharola, Tiwari & Mohan, 2010; Oni & Okanlawon, 2010; Agbonkhese, Yisa, Agbonkhese, Akabi, Aka & Mondigha, 2013; Asalor, 2010; Adele, 2011). According to the Federal Office of Statistics, the transport sector contributed about 5% of the Nigerian GDP as of 2016, and road transport controlled about 85% of this figure and left the remaining 15% to air, water and rail transports in the country. More so, as of 2012, Nigeria has a total of 193, 200km of roads. This is comprised of 34,123km of federal roads, 30,500km of state roads and 129, 577km of local government roads. Furthermore, it was also noted that road transport accounts for about 90% of all the internal movements in Nigeria (FGN, 2010; Odugbemi, 2010; Aderamo, 2012; Nwankwo, 2017).

Despite this tremendous contribution of road transport to tourism development in Nigeria, the sector has been plagued with multiple challenges arising from various traffic risks. Some studies have identified accidents and other traffic risks like armed robbery as amongst the major impediments to domestic road transport in Nigeria (Aldona & Grazvydas, 2007; Atubi, 2009;

Aworemi, Abdul-Azeez & Olabode, 2010; Ladan, 2013; Faajir & Zidan, 2016). This has been identified to be much common amongst commercial road transport companies according to the Federal Road Safety Commission (FRSC) of Nigeria (Folagbade, 2015; Jeremiah, 2016). Jeremiah (2016) went further to note that FRSC had reported that Nigeria as a nation had witnessed sixty-one thousand eight hundred and six (61,806) road traffic crashes between 2010-2014. This figure was approximated to fifty-two thousand three hundred and forty (52, 340) between 2014 and 2016. FRSC reported that in July 2017, road traffic crashes caused 423 deaths and 2339 injuries. FRSC further informed that this figure has 41% increase from that of June 2017 (AIT News, 2017). This has put up the question of ‘Thistle or Pop-sock’ for domestic transport and tourist safety in Nigeria. There is a need for urgent measures to drastically reduce the menace of road traffic risk to domestic travellers in Nigeria. Most of the previous studies have identified various causes of these road traffic crashes and went further to reveal that various road traffic laws and policies have been designed to check this menace (Friday, 2012; Gana & Emmanuel, 2014; Sumaila, 2013; Adetunji, 2014; Jeremiah, 2016). There is no doubt that these traffic policies and laws were systematically and strategically designed to check the menace of road traffic risks in the country, but the question is ‘What is the level of compliance with these traffic laws and policies in Nigeria by various commercial road transport companies?’. However, this study is a continuation of related previous studies which aim to identify the level of compliance with road transport policies among commercial transport companies. The study has implications for sustainable domestic tourism growth in Nigeria through reasonable compliance with road traffic laws and policies amongst commercial road transport companies in Nigeria.

Review of Related Literature

Previous studies have been able to look at the tendencies of domestic tourism to local, regional and national economics if sustainably developed. For instance, Ogbonna, Ibe and Ikegwu (2018) inform that domestic tourism is among the keys to regional development in the 21st-century Africa. They also note that quality promotional strategies should be inculcated in domestic tourism planning in Africa. They further identified poor funding and security issues among others, as the bane of sustainable tourism development in Lagos State, Nigeria (Ogbonna et al, 2018). In support of this view, Bello and Bello (2019) noted that there is a need to promote destination images to boost domestic tourism development in parts of Africa. They see the relationship between destinations, choices and domestic tourists in Obudu Mountain Resort, Calabar. They concluded by noting that the gains of domestic tourism will be fully harnessed if sustainably developed (Bellow & Bello, 2019). In another related study that was conducted in Algeria, Mokhefi, Hamoul and Sawsan, are of the opinion that domestic tourism development has the potentialities of revitalizing the Algerian economy looking at the historical antecedents. They went further to note that strategic management principles and other relevant policies for actors in the tourism industry should be put in place to check the activities of various actors in the industry and further enhance the opportunities for domestic tourism development in Algeria. In line with this view, Kirillova, Zhilinkova, Golovkina and Finko (2021) noted that domestic tourism has transformed the economic opportunities in parts of Russia despite some inherent challenges. They further argued that the gains of domestic tourism which have made a significant contribution to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of Russian Federation, might be lost if the existing policies and regulations in the industry are not monitored by the relevant government agencies. They suggested a dynamic model as an approach to check tourism activities and related services in Russia and to promote sustainable domestic tourism development. (Kirillova, et al, 2021).

Furthermore, some other studies focused on the participation and involvement of relevant actors for the sustainable development of domestic tourism in parts of the globe. For instance, Isiaka (2019) is of the view that domestic tourism consumers are among the five major actors for sustainable domestic tourism that should be considered in domestic tourism discourse. He further considered the socio-economic characteristics of domestic town consumers in Ibadan, Nigeria, to include those that patronize the transport and hospitality sectors, and tourist sites and destinations (Isiaka, 2019). More so, Macha (2021) is of the opinion that the host communities are among the integral stakeholders that play significant roles in domestic tourism development. Their participation and involvement are indispensable in domestic tourism development in Tanzania, hence the need for their consideration by tourism policymakers in Tanzania (Macha, 2021). In addition, Kifworo, Okello and Mapelu (2020) are of the view that significant participation is among the strategies for domestic tourism development in Kenya. They studied demographic profiling and domestic tourism participation behaviour in Nairobi, County, Kenya. The study revealed that the majority of domestic tourism participants in Kenya were Kenyans. They further recommended making responsible policy frameworks for domestic tourism in Kenya (Kifworo et al, 2001). These studies focused on the contributions of domestic tourism to regional and local economies, stakeholder involvement in sustainable domestic tourism development, strategic policy frameworks and responsible implementation strategies to promote the gains of domestic tourism in the revitalization of local and regional economies. However, the current study is focusing on harnessing the gains of commercial road transportation to sustainable domestic tourism development in Nigeria through compliance with the existing road transport policies in Nigeria.

Furthermore, some other works have discussed extensively the issue of road traffic safety, the nature of the risks, causes, measures and available road traffic laws and policies. For instance, Joewono and Kubula (2006) inform that the most vulnerable in traffic crashes are the passengers, and further suggested improvement in the technology, management and institution to combat the menace. Also, Kanafani and Huang (2010) note that apart from the management who should invest more in safety and security to manage road traffic crashes, the government also has a role to play in that regard. Kover, Hardmeier, Michel and Schivaninger (2008) identified that electronic and sophisticated screening of passengers' bags could help in identifying dangerous objects that could be threats to road traffic safety. In that same line, Bell, Taylor, Chen, Kirk and Leatherman (2017) suggested supervisory coaching and monitoring as effective techniques to curb the menace of roadway accidents through significant improvement in driving habits amongst commercial drivers. Jennissen, Harland, Wetjen, Hoogerwerf, and O'Denning (2017) investigated the use of All-Terrain Vehicle Safety Knowledge (ATV) as a means of curbing the menace of roadway accidents amongst the rural population. They went further to suggest periodic orientation programmes on road traffic safety amongst the rural population. The concern of O'Neill and Mohan (2002) is the establishment of a designated public agency for road traffic control and management as a means of eradicating road crashes.

In two separate studies, Mohan (2011 and 2013) was of the view that internationally compliant measures like pedestrian and cyclist safety, motorcycle and motor vehicle safety, road safety measures, enforcements, and research and policy thrust would drastically reduce road traffic crashes. Kharola, Tiwari and Mohan (2010) in their study noted that modifications in designs such as low floors, automatic closing doors, safer bus fronts and segregated infrastructure for bicycles and pedestrians would reduce the threats of road traffic crashes.

Moreover, Oni and Okanlawon (2010) suggested the use of film shows as part of road traffic enlightenment programmes while suggesting establishments of credible driving schools and maximum support to road traffic agencies as ways of combating the menace of road accidents in Nigeria. Also Aghonkhesse et al (2013) identified intense alcohol consumption amongst drivers as one of the major causes of road traffic accidents in Nigeria. In this regard, they suggested sanitation of motor parks from alcohol sales and consumption, the establishment of sobriety checkpoints for alcoholic drivers, comprehensive vehicle maintenance and repair, and the use of speed limit regulations. Faajir and Zidan (2016) identified poor maintenance culture, weak management and obsolete facilities as amongst the key causes of roadway accidents in Nigeria and Egypt. They went further to suggest strategic integration efforts by both public and private sectors of the economy as amongst the solutions. In another study, Tunde, Taiwo and Matanmi (2012) identified below-average compliance with the existing road safety policies as the major cause of roadway accidents amongst motorcyclists in Nigeria. They suggested that road safety agents should sit up in the implementation of these safety policies and equally collaborate with the various commercial unions of these motorcyclists.

Moreso, Friday (2012) identified the wrong attitudes of drivers as amongst the causes of roadway accidents in Nigeria. The author went further to recommend structural and digital means of controlling and monitoring the activities of road users to ensure reasonable compliance with the existing traffic laws and policies. Following this view, Gana and Emmanuel (2014) identified the presence of deficient legal frameworks and most of the time their weak enforcement, as the major challenges to road traffic safety in Nigeria. They further suggested adequate funding of the FRSC as the way out. Also, Sumaila (2013) identified poor attitudes of drivers and limitations of the FRSC in implementing traffic laws and policies, and weak traffic education, as amongst the major causes of road accidents in Nigeria. He further suggested total restructuring and support for the FRSC by both public and private sectors as amongst the ways of tackling road safety challenges in Nigeria. Finally, Olubomehin (2012) noted that road traffic accidents are the major hindrance to maximizing the gains of transportation for economic development in Western Nigeria. He viewed promulgation and periodic review of relevant laws, coupled with systematic road traffic education, as amongst the ways to combat the challenges of roadway crashes in Nigeria.

These studies have made tremendous contributions to this particular study by giving a platform and future directions on domestic travel, domestic tourism, road safety and national development in Nigeria. This current study, however, focused on investigating the level of compliance with the existing road safety policies by drivers of various commercial transport companies in Nigeria. This is necessary hence compliance with the existing road traffic laws and policies would go a long way in combating the challenges of roadway crashes as well as encouraging domestic travel and domestic tourism in Nigeria.

Clarification of key concepts

Clarifying some basic concepts in the study would enhance the understanding of the basic premise of the study. First and foremost, Domestic Tourism has been defined as a kind of tourism activity within a country (Okpoko & Okpoko, 2002; Nwankwo, 2017). For the purpose

of this study, domestic tourism is seen as tourism activities within a country by the citizens for various degrees of tourism purposes.

Domestic Transport is another notable concept that was used in the study. It has to do with all kinds of transport activities within a country. It involves the movement of people within a nation through available means of transportation like land, air and/or water, (Page, 2009; Rodrique, 2013).

Another concept that was used in the study is ‘Road Transport’. This has to do with all kinds of transport activities that involve the use of roads by vehicles. It usually takes place in various road networks within a particular geographic location (Page, 2009; Nwankwo, 2017). This study focused on commercial road transport companies to understand their contributions to domestic tourism in Nigeria.

However, Travelers’ safety as one of the reoccurring concepts in the study has to do with every attempt, measure, policy and action put together to guarantee safe trips for various travellers’ (Summala, 1988; Lumsden & Tolley, 2004; Straddling & Anable, 2008). It is the state of safe travels for road passengers who use various kinds of transport systems. This study is focusing on the state of safe travels for road transport users in Nigeria.

The last but not the least is Transport Policy. This has to do with all kinds of rules and regulations that have been designed to check avoidable road traffic crashes in the transport industry (Aldona & Grazvydas, 2012; Aderamo, 2012; Adetunji, 2014). Transport policy can also be defined as “...the framework for transport regulations and control implying a rule-setting function on the part of the government with a view to providing a rational, efficient, comfortable, safe and cost-effective transport system” (Sumaila, 2013 pp.507-508). This study is focused on the aspects of the tourism policy that border on the activities of road transport companies with a view to controlling incessant and avoidable roadway crashes in Nigeria. Among the objectives of designing road transport policies in Nigeria are: to enhance road productivity through efficient utilization, to enhance private sector operation and finally to maintain complete adherence to road traffic regulations and rules to enhance safety on the road.

Methods

The study adopted a survey research design. The population of the study was estimated to be 860 registered commercial road transport companies in Nigeria that ply across the states of the federation. More so, the estimated population of the informants stood at 2500 company drivers and 1200 company managers. Multi-stage sampling technique was adopted for the study. In the first stage, a simple random sampling technique was used to sample 39 commercial road transport companies in Nigeria. In the second stage, a purposive sampling technique was used to sample 117 informants from Company Drivers (CD) and Company Managers (CM) for key informant interview sessions and focus group discussion sessions. This gave 65 CDs and 52 CMs. More so, in the third stage, convenience sampling technique was used to sample 25 CDs and 22 CMs for the key informant interview sessions. The average duration for these interview sessions was one hour, fifteen minutes (1:15mins) for each of the key informants. In the final stage, the remaining sample size of 40 CDs and 30 CMs were clustered into ten groups of seven each (4 CDs and 3 CMs) for focus group discussion. These FGD sessions took place at the terminals of these companies in the evening hours, as requested by the participants. Each of the FGD sessions lasted for 50 minutes on average. These key informant interview sessions and

focus group discussion sessions took place from November 2016 to October 2019 with the assistance of 26 field assistants. Before the study proper, a mini research workshop was organized for these field assistants at the University of Nigeria Nsukka to intimate to them the research objectives, methods and processes, in order to facilitate responsible and smooth research activities during the field research. The observational method was used to ascertain the actual level of compliance with these road traffic laws and policies. Moreso, documentary sources were equally helpful in the cross-fertilization of data. Finally, descriptive and evaluative methods of qualitative data analysis, coupled with simple percentages, were used in analysing the collated data.

Results and Discussions

The relevance of this study to tourism has so much bordered on the transportation of tourists especially domestic land transport. Hence domestic tourism contributes significantly to national tourism development (Ojo, 2017; Olaitan, 2017). The increased risk that is associated with land transportation has potentialities of contributing to a downward trend in domestic tourist traffic especially in developing nations like Nigeria where domestic tourism has the highest share in the tourism industry. This has attracted some studies on domestic land transportation and how best to increase the level of safety at land transportation (see Burgus, Madsen, Sanderson, and Rautainen, 2009; Rogers, 2008; Boswan, Aitkem, Helinkamp, Maham and Graham, 2009; Wu & Xiaojiang, 1999; Bhalla, Ezzati, Malial; Solomon, and Reich, 2007; Ajiboye & Afolayam, 2009). This study focused on the level of compliance with road transport policies among the various commercial land transport companies in Nigeria.

Thirty-nine (39) commercial road transport companies were visited during the study to investigate their level of compliance with the existing road traffic laws and policies. The 117 informants for the study are comprised of men within the age bracket of 30-60 years. More emphasis was on the most active of this age bracket (40-50 years). Fortypercentage of them was sampled for Key informant interviews while the remaining sixty was organized for Focus group discussion sessions. These sessions were organized during their convenient periods as they seemed busy with their job demands. During the field observations, the various terminals of the sampled road transport companies were visited and hours spend to ascertain some of their claims during key informant interviews and focus group discussion sessions. Moreover, on educational background, 35% of the informants has First School Leaving Certificate (FSLC), 27% of the participants has Senior School Certificate Education (SSCE), 18% have Diploma/NSE/National Diploma, 13% of them have Bachelor's Degree/Higher National Diploma with only 7% of them having educational qualifications more than Bachelor's Degree/Higher National Diploma. Information from key informants informed that apart from the established national road transport traffic policies, there are some other local traffic policies that were equally designed to complement the national road traffic policy. The national road traffic policy is enshrined in the Road Transport Safety Standardization Scheme (RTSSS) created by law in the National Road Traffic Regulations (NRTR) 2004 section 15, and that of sections 5 and 10 of the Federal Road Safety Commission Act of 2007. Unfortunately, most of the companies studied do not have a comprehensive knowledge of these Acts as it concerns their operations in the industry. That notwithstanding, the concern of this study is to ascertain their level of compliance with those transport policies they have knowledge of. However, this presentation would be based only on

the national policies since most of the claimed local policies are either parts of the national policies or supportive instruments to the actualization of the national policies.

However, thirty transport policies were sampled based on knowledge level to ascertain the level of compliance. The presentation is illustrated with the level of compliance to the identified national policies evaluated with the High (70% – 100%), Moderate (41% - 69%) and Low (0% - 40%) paradigms. In most cases, data from key informant interview sessions and focus group discussion sessions were fused together since there was no reasonable difference. They are presented in a table using simple statistics to represent the views of each of the 117 informants that participated during the key informant interview sessions and focus group discussion sessions.

Table 1: Driver-related transport policies and level of compliance amongst selected transport companies in Nigeria

Level of compliance	Training & Retraining	Counselling	Periodic Medicals	Night Travels	Certifications
Low	48.7%	53.8%	58.9%	74.3%	0.0%
Moderate	38.4%	41.5%	41.0%	17.9%	64.1%
High	12.8%	5.1%	0.0%	7.6%	35.8%
Total average for Driving - related policies	LOW: 47.0% (CD-49%, CM-51%) MODERATE: 40.6% (CD-47%, CM-53%) HIGH: 12.3% (CD-61%, CM-39%)				

Source: Field Survey (2018)

In the first column of Table 1, the issue of training and retraining drivers for efficient land transport has an average compliance. This particular policy was meant to ensure that commercial road transport drivers undergo periodic trainings to update their driving skills and road traffic knowledge, engage in counselling sessions, ensure periodic medicals for drivers, ensure that two drivers are available for night travels per vehicle, and ensure valid drivers' certification. It is regrettable that only 12.3% on the average of these commercial land transport companies gave needed compliance to this policy, and a greater percentage (61%) of this response came from company drivers. Also, observations reveal that there is low-level of compliance with those driver-related transport policies among the various companies that were sampled for the study. While the management was trying to pretend about this lapse, the drivers were vocal and their (drivers) responses corresponded with information from the observation. This was also the case during FGD sessions as most of the drivers felt that they were not well taken care of, and many of the company managers were bent on protecting the image of their companies. The implication is that there is below-average compliance with driver-related transport policies among commercial land transport companies in Nigeria. Summala (1988, in Salminen ,1995), and Salminen and Lahdeniemi (2002) maintained that a work-related environment contributes to a level of performance and compliance level with the existing rules. Most of the five paradigms in Table 7 are motivated by the management of commercial road transport companies hence they determine their compliance level with a greater extent.

Table 2: Vehicle-related transport policies and level of compliance among selected transport companies in Nigeria.

Level of compliance	Replacement	Maintenance	Electronic Vehicle Monitoring	Functional vehicle Parts	Brake System
Low	51.9%	5.1%	66.6%	0.00%	0.00%
Moderate	69.2%	66.6%	33.3%	64.1%	46.1%
High	25.6%	28.2%	0.0%	35.8%	53.8%
Total average for vehicle-related transport policies		LOW: 15.4% (CD-52%, CM-48%) MODERATE: 55.9% (CD-40%, CM-60%) HIGH: 28.7% (CD-32%, CM-68%)			

Source: Field Survey (2018)

Moreover, the essence of vehicle-related transport policies is to ensure the effective function of vehicles while on duty. Data in Table 2 shows that on average, the compliance level with this group of road transport policies stood at a moderate level of 55.9% with a greater percentage (60%) of the responses coming from company managers. This may not have completely corresponded with data from observation which shows that there is poor maintenance culture among these road transport companies as many of them do not show reasonable concern about vehicle maintenance. Interactions during FGD sessions showed that most of the studies revealed that transport companies lacked reasonable maintenance culture for their vehicles. A well-functioning vehicle reduces the rate of accidents on the highways especially commercial transport vehicles (Beck & West, 2010; Boal & Rodriguez-Acosta, 2016). Also, Wilson (2010) and Wu, Ageuro-Valverde and Jovanis (2014) note that half-functional vehicles contribute to traffic-related fatalities. During the field research for this study, it was observed that most of the commercial land transport companies pay average attention to the state of their vehicle with much concentration on profits. Agbonkheshe (2013) and Folagbade (2015) were of the view that the state of vehicles contributes to road transport safety in Nigeria.

Table 3: Company-related transport policies and level of compliance among selected transport companies in Nigeria.

Level of compliance	Safety Unit	Insurance	Traffic Records	Terminal Security	Professional Recruitment
Low	58.9%	64.1%	28.2%	25.6%	5.1%
Moderate	28.2%	33.3%	46.1%	53.8%	74.3%
High	12.8%	2.6%	25.6%	20.5%	20.5%
Total average for Company-related policies		LOW: 36.4% (CD-49%, CM-51%) MODERATE: 47.1% (CD-45%, CM-55%) HIGH : 16.4% (CD-48%, CM-52%)			

Source: Field Survey (2018)

Also, another aspect of this study was on the company-related transport policies (see Table 3). This has to do with necessary provisions for safety guarantee by managements of commercial transport companies. On average, this group of transport policies has a moderate level of compliance at 47.1% with a greater percentage (55%) coming from the company’s managers. Observation reveals that there is below-average compliance with company-related transport policies, hence there is conformity with information from key informant interviews and focus group discussions. It is unfortunate that below-average compliance is noticed in the first two

columns and this has serious consequences on the lives of passengers and drivers. For instance, a valid insurance policy would have enabled these companies to improve significantly on their level of compliance with all the transport safety policies knowing fully well the grave consequence when there are crashes and fatalities. Faajir and Zidan (2016), and Olamigoke and Emmanuel (2013) note that managements of commercial transport companies are at the centre of road crashes control in Nigeria due to the extent they can motivate compliance with transport safety policies. Also, Sumaila (2013) decried that the absence of safety units or management, that are designated for the control of road crashes and monitoring, does not give Nigeria the opportunity to maximise the gains of road transportation for national development.

Table 4: Travel-related transport policies and level of compliance among selected transport companies in Nigeria.

Level of compliance	Vehicle Check	Safety Features	Carrying capacity	Load Compartment	Speed Limit
Low	17.9%	2.6%	0.00%	0.00%	2.6%
Moderate	56.4%	64.1%	48.7%	53.8%	87.2%
High	25.6%	33.3%	51.3%	46.1%	10.2%
Total average for Travel - related transport policies		LOW: 4.6% (CD-65%, CM-35%) MODERATE: 62.0 % (CD-48%, CM-52%) HIGH : 33.3% (CD-42%, CM-58%)			

Source: Field Survey (2018)

Moreover, the study also worked on travel-related transport policies. Table 4 reveals that on average, there is a moderate level of compliance with these group of transport policies at 62.0%. A greater percentage (52%) of this came from company’s managers. Also during observations, it was revealed that compliance with this group of policies was relatively above average. This may be due to the fact that such policies are beneficial to the company if there is reasonable compliance with them. This was also the case during FGD sessions as a majority of the participants put up a stronger argument on this. For instance, one of the managers noted that they need to guarantee the safety of travellers to boost their opportunities in the industry. In the last column of Table 4, virtually all the responses showed moderate compliance with speed limit control. The Federal Road Safety Commission of Nigeria had warned that commercial road transport buses should not speed above 100km when carrying passengers. This is because overspeeding has been reported as amongst the major causes of road crashes and fatalities (e.g.Gana & Emmanuel, 2014; Jeremiah, 2016). Mohan (2012) has also informed that uncontrolled speeding is amongst the causes of the road traffic crashes in India and he went further to suggest a feasible speed-control policy for commercial transportation in India. FRSC had directed commercial road transport companies to install speed limiters in their vehicles which moderate speed level to 100km. It is quite unfortunate that only a very few of these motorists comply with this directive.

Table 5: Passenger-related transport policies and level of compliance among selected transport companies in Nigeria.

Level of compliance	Emergency Exit	Standard Terminals	Passengers Manifest	Pre-travel screening	Contact information
Low	69.2%	5.1%	2.6%	53.8%	33.3%
Moderate	30.8%	51.3%	7.7%	46.2%	43.6%
High	0.0%	43.6%	89.7%	0.00%	23.0%
Total average for Passenger-related transport policies	LOW: 32.8% (CD-62%, CM-38%) MODERATE: 35.9% (CD-56%, CM-44%) HIGH: 31.3% (CD-42%, CM-58%)				

Source: Field Survey 2018)

In addition, Table 5 has to do with passenger-related transport policies. Responses from drivers and managers coupled with information from the observation affirmed that there is below-average compliance with passenger-related transport policies. There is a high level of negligence in this group of policies among the sampled road transport companies. This resulted in below average compliance which stood at 35.9% as shown in Table 5 above. Only column three of Table 5 has maximum compliance with the use of passengers’ manifest but other areas that needed more safety consciousness like columns one, four and five have below-average compliance level (see Table 5). Although in column one, the passenger’s exit facility is more common with big commercial buses while this study focused more on the small commercial buses that are commonly used for intra and inter-state domestic transport in Nigeria today. During FGD sessions, they informed that the pre-travel passengers’ and luggage screening transport policy was meant to screen out dangerous passengers with ulterior motives and luggage that contain weapons and explosives that can hinder safety during travel. It is regrettable that most of the commercial transport companies do not pay attention to this policy thereby endangering the lives of genuine passengers in the hands of criminal-minded passengers. Kharola, Tlwari and Mohan (2010) inform that human-induced road crashes among commercial buses can be reduced through pre-travel screening. Also, Olamigoke and Emmanuel (2013) note that passengers’ safety should be paramount in an attempt to guarantee the sustainable contribution of land transportation to the economic development of localities.

Table 6: Attitude-related transport policies and level of compliance among selected transport companies in Nigeria.

Level of compliance	No alcohol and Drugs	Mobile phones or phone calls	Rest periods	Traffic signs	Communication systems
Low	2.6%	10.3%	35.9%	2.6%	46.1%
Moderate	84.6%	79.5%	43.6%	56.4%	41.0%
High	12.8%	10.3%	20.5%	41.0%	12.8%
Total average for attitude-related transport policies	LOW: 19.5% (CD-62%, CM-38%) MODERATE: 61.0% (CD-54%, CM-46%) HIGH: 19.5% (CD-66%, CM-34%)				

Source: Field Survey (2018)

Finally, the study investigated the compliance level with attitude-related transport policies (see Table 6 above). Attitudinal factors and state of the mind have been identified as amongst the

major causes of road traffic crashes (Aworemi, Abdul-Azeez and Olabode, 2010; Adiele, 2011; Wilson & Stimpson, 2010; Rodgers, 2008; Sumaila, 2013; Mohan, 2004). Unfortunately, data in Table 6 shows that overall compliance to attitude-related transport policies in Nigeria among commercial buses is a little above average (61.0%). This conforms with information from the observation, not minding the fact that many of the drivers attempted to pretend that they have excellent conduct in their jobs when 66% of them claimed that they have a high compliance level to attitude-related road transport policies. For instance, during FGD sessions for group 2, the majority of the participants informed that they needed to make efforts to ensure safety on wheels for both their lives and that of their passengers. The state of mind of the driver is a force to contend with in the control of road traffic crashes in Nigeria. Smoking, alcohol and drug abuse coupled with the use of mobile phones by commercial transport drivers while on duty have contributed to the poor state of mind of drivers while driving. For instance, during the field observation, passengers refused to be driven out of the terminal by a commercial driver of one of the notable commercial transport companies in Enugu because of the deep smell of alcohol from this particular driver. These passengers insisted that the company should either transfer them to another bus or assign another driver to drive them to their destination (Port Harcourt-Nigeria). There is a need for optimal compliance with attitude-related transport policies in Nigeria to significantly reduce attitude-related caused road traffic crashes and at the same time restore the confidence of domestic transport users.

In the introductory section, the study had already noted that most of the developing nations like Nigeria have their tourism base on domestic tourism with a concentrated effort by domestic transportation which is motivated by huge natural, cultural and built attractions. It went further to note that the incessant road traffic crashes involving commercial buses are detrimental to domestic tourism growth through a drastic decline in land transport travels by various tourists. Joewono & Kubuta (2006) assert that in road traffic crashes the most vulnerable are the passengers and also the drivers. They went further to note that plans to encourage reductions in road traffic crashes would motivate domestic travel. Wu and Xiaojiang (1999) note that such improvements in road safety would encourage sustainable national development. Ladan (2013), Olamigoke and Emmanuel (2013), and Lubomehin (2012) supported this view by adding that an efficient land transport system has the potential of fostering national integration and development through sustained patronage from the sector.

However, this study has revealed that irrespective of the fact that there are beautiful transport policies that are meant to encourage sustainable transport through safety, a poor level of compliance has been the bane of the sustainability and growth of domestic land transportation in Nigeria. A number of tourism resources abound in various nooks and crannies of Nigeria. These wonderful tourist attractions have the potentialities of growing the economy of this nation from within through sustainable domestic transport. Sustainable safe land transportation encourages both domestic and international tourists to make intra and inter-state travels in the country. Hence air transport in Nigeria is much limited in coverage as visits to many attractions demand land transportation.

Implications of sustainable domestic tourism development in Nigeria

Tourism involves movement facilitated by transportation. Hence every traveller is not a tourist but every tourist is a traveller. Page (2009) informed that transportation is the greatest facilitator of tourism after tourism purposes. In most cases, the rate of travels within a specific period of time is motivated by the availability, safety and efficiency of the transport system. It is worth noting at this juncture that only about 35% of travellers at a given time would be termed tourists judging from the integral make-up of tourist and tourism definitions. The focus of this study is largely on this 35% who could decline travel due to safety considerations. Ladan (2012) infers that a safety guarantee facilitates the decision to travel hence every traveller would want to come back alive. That notwithstanding, since leisure and other tourism purposes are the major motivations for tourist travels, a decline to travel due to perceived safety threats is much simpler for a tourist than for an ordinary traveller.

Safety threats have been identified as the bane of sustainable land transportation regardless of the fact that there are viable transport safety policies that can check road traffic crashes to foster national integration and growth (Ladan, 2013; Olamigoke & Emmanuel, 2013; Olubomehin, 2012). The question of compliance has been identified as the bane of these transport safety policies (Friday, 2012; Adetunji, 2014; Jeremiah, 2016). The totality of results from the study shows that there is average compliance with road transport policies by commercial road transport companies in Nigeria. For instance, Table 7 below gives a cumulative of the statistics of the level of compliance with various transport policies, to Low-26.0%, Moderate-50.4% and High-23.6%. Moreover, apart from a low level of compliance which is about 10% difference between responses from drivers and managers, there is an insignificant difference between the claims from these two groups of informants used for the study in some other paradigms used for the study. This also supports the findings from observations which affirmed the average compliance level with these road transport policies among commercial road transport companies in Nigeria. The overall implication of this result is that there is average compliance with road transport policies in Nigeria by commercial road transport companies. This has been attributed to negligence, ignorance and inadequate implementation and monitoring of existing road transport policies. Sumaila (2013) noted that among the challenges of road transportation in Nigeria is increasing road traffic crashes as a result of the presence of numerous operators and their inadequacy of requisite driving skills, poor vehicle maintenance and poor implementation of relevant policies. In the same line, Jeremiah (2016) asserts that according to the World Health Organization (judging from the increasing rate of road traffic crashes), an estimated 1.25 million lives would have been lost mostly in developing nations where there is poor level of compliance with the existing road traffic rules. This has raised further questions on the safety of road transport travels in Nigeria.

Table 7: A cumulative compliance table of all the studied transport policies

Categories of Transport Policies	Low	Moderate	High
Driving-related policies	47.0%	40.6%	12.3%
Vehicle- related Policies	15.4%	55.9%	28.7%
Company-related Policies	36.4%	47.1%	16.4%
Travel-related Policies	4.6%	62.0%	33.3%

Passenger-related policies	32.8%	35.9%	31.3%
Attitude-related policies	19.5%	61.0%	19.5%
TOTAL CUMULATIVE	26.0% (CD-56.5%, CM-43.5%)	50.4% (CD-48.3%, CM-51.6%)	23.6% (CD-48.5%, CM-51.5%)

Source: Field Survey (2018)

More so, as noted earlier, domestic tourism refers to that type of tourism experience within a country by local residents. It does not involve visitors or tourists from other countries (Mokhefi, Hamoul & Sawsan, 2017; Bello & Bello, 2019; Kifworo, Okello & Mapelu, 2021). In such tourism experience, residents of a country engage in many kinds of tourist activities, including visits to sites, destinations, museums, parks, heritage sites, built attraction sites and other classifications of tourism experience, as tourists. Some studies have noted that domestic tourism experience accounts for 75% of total tourism experience within a national boundary. And that this percentage is most of the time higher in developing nations (Ogbonna, Ibe & Ikegwu, 2018; Isiaka, 2019; Macha, 2021). This explains why most nations have built their tourism investment opportunities with more focus on domestic tourism. Also during severe international restrictions on movements as a result of pandemics (i.e. COVID, etc), wars/conflicts, international politics among others, international tourism experience becomes irrelevant, leaving domestic tourism to control the overall percentage (100%) of tourism experience in a particular nation. One of such cases was the global fight against COVID-19 pandemic from 2019 through 2021 when international boundaries of most nations were closed against international visitors. This dealt a major blow to the international tourism experience (see Oruonye & Ahmed, 2020; Ugur & Akbiyik, 2020; Skare, Soriano, & Porada-Rochon, 2021).

Howbeit, among all the transport modes (i.e. air transport, water transport, rail transport, land transport, animal transport, etc), land transport or road transport, contributes to about 75% of domestic travels and other movements. This explains why road transport networks dominate the transport system of cities (see Ogbonna, Ibeh & Ikegwu, 2018; Bello & Bello, 2019). People find it more convenient to make use of road transport due to less cost implications, wider network coverage, easy accessibility, among others. These factors have promoted domestic tourism tremendously across Africa. It has provided tourists with the opportunity to access various tourist destinations within a place with less stress and cost, and at the same time afford them the opportunity of a clearer view of a destination’s tourism features while in transit. Ogbonna et al (2018) and, Bello and Bello (2019) in their separate studies identified domestic tourism as the key to Nigerian tourism survival in the 21st century. Both commercial and private means have facilitated domestic travels and domestic tourism in Nigeria and, some other Sub-Saharan nations.

More so, road transport services as provided by commercial road transport companies, have dominated the Nigerian domestic travel industry since independence in 1960. This has opened up the industry for more investors and investments. That notwithstanding, the major challenges of this industry have been safety issues. This study has tried to understand the causes of these safety issues from the compliance with existing transport policies in Nigeria, among domestic transport companies in Nigeria. However, this study has made some findings which have an implication for the nation's domestic tourism industry. Unchecked safety issues have the tendency of diminishing the valued contributions of road transport services to domestic tourism in Nigeria through the movement of tourists across various destinations. Below are some of the implications

of the results of this study, for sustainable domestic tourism development in Nigeria. These implications are considered according to the various variables that anchored the study.

First and foremost, investigation of the driver-related transport policies shows that most of the drivers of commercial vehicles lack requisite training, are poorly counselled by the companies, lack periodic medicals, engage in regular night travels without rests, have poor certifications as demanded by the transport policies, among others. These put together has implications on the psyche of the driver and his individual disposition while on duty. Frustrations and depressions are always the end point of such conditions. This exposes their passenger to verbal abuses, avoidable crashes, and loss of confidence in a particular transport company. Most tourists are discouraged from future travels when experienced such trips in their previous experiences. And such feelings may demean the essence of domestic tourism and drastically discourage domestic tourism traffic if not checked.

More so, investigations on the level of compliance with Vehicle-related transport policies revealed that most of the vehicles for commercial road transport in Nigeria lack basic and periodic maintenance. Travel experience with such vehicles discourages tourists and other travellers from either using the same road transport company or being careful about the choice of vehicles for future travels. It creates negative anticipations and perceptions on future journeys hence every tourist would like to come back alive to rejoin his or her family members (see Kifworo, Okello & Mapelu, 2020). A continued low complication to vehicle-related transport policies will cause a sharp drop in domestic tourism patronage in Nigeria. Domestic tourism will not be sustainable when vehicles that control over 65% of movements, are perceived by tourists as unsafe.

In addition, compliance with Company-related transport policies was also investigated. Road transport companies are among the major considerations of tourists and other travellers while making a choice of the travel mode to use and the transport company to patronize. The Nigerian transport policies have specified some obligations of these road transport companies towards a successful travel and tour experience in Nigeria. However, the result of the study shows that most of these transport companies do not have safety units, quality insurance policies and efficient terminal security. While many of them that were investigated do not have good knowledge of these policies, some of them do not comply with the existing policies. This has huge implications for the domestic tourism since company efficiency in the road transport business would guarantee increased profit among other benefits in the industry. Domestic tourists are encouraged to repeat visits using a particular road transport company if the previous experience was good. Also, their word-of mouth-campaign has implications for increasing tourist flow for the domestic tourism experience.

Furthermore, Travel-related transport policies were also investigated to ascertain the level of compliance. The overall travel experience is a factor to be considered before engaging in domestic tourism experience. Activities going on at the terminals and what happens while in transit have implications for the level of patronage. Results from this investigation show that there is moderate compliance with this group of transport policies in Nigeria. For instance, compliance with road transport policies in the areas of carrying capacity, speed limit, load compartment among others, are moderate. This has positive implications on tourists/travellers' sense of comfort while in transit. It is one of the major boosts for tourist traffic to domestic tourist destinations in Nigeria. Domestic tourism is much more effective when tourists and other

travellers are motivated to make domestic travels across urban and rural areas in Nigeria. This motivation opens up opportunities for visits to numerous tourist destinations and for other events like cultural festivals, masquerading, and sports festivals, among others. This is a good motivation for sustainable domestic tourism development in Nigeria.

On the other hand, Passenger-related transport policies were investigated. These policies border on the safety of passengers while in transit. They include the availability of emergency exits during emergency situations, availability of standard terminals, use of passenger manifest, pre-travel screening, availability of contact information, among others. These policies give tourists and other travellers a sense of safety while in transit. It motivates the desire for travels within a nation hence the belief of a safe return after travels. The result of this investigation shows that there is average compliance with these policies. Some studies note that a sense of safety and belief in safe return after travels, motivates domestic travels and domestic tourism within a place (Mokhefi et al, 2017; Isiaka, 2019; Kifworo et al, 2020).

Finally, Altitude-related transport policies were also considered in the course of the study. This group of transport policies border on the altitude of drivers of commercial road transport companies while on duty. Drivers' altitudes may detest, discourage, encourage, motivate or discourage future patronages from tourists and other travellers. This borders on issues like the use of phones while in transit, observation of traffic signs while in transit, alcohol or drug addictions, having rest in between two journeys, among others. The result shows that there is average compliance with these policies by commercial transport drivers in Nigeria. This implies that domestic tourists and other travellers in Nigeria will have less fear for their safety at various tourist destinations since most of the drivers comply reasonably with altitude-related transport policies. This is another motivation for sustainable domestic tourism development in Nigeria.

Conclusion

This study investigated the level of compliance with existing transport policies in Nigeria among commercial road transport drivers. On average, the result of the study revealed that the level of compliance with these transport policies in Nigeria is below average. However, there is a need for urgent steps to facilitate maximum compliance with road traffic policies. The industry seemed porous with an unchecked influx of actors without due regard to the existing laws and policies. This study further makes the following recommendations that are expected to facilitate adequate compliance with the existing road traffic policies in Nigeria: establishment of safety units should be much more compulsory and its activities investigated periodically by traffic agencies without prior notice to the transport companies; commercial road transport drivers should be placed on salaries and not on returns per-trip to reduce reckless driving and overspeeding; there should be strict monitoring to ensure that commercial road transport companies operate with a valid and active insurance policy that is honoured to the maximum during road traffic crashes; phone and email contacts of the management of these companies should be boldly written on both inside and outside these commercial buses to make way for easy complaints to the appropriate authority, and the FRSC should be well equipped to facilitate adequate monitoring and implementation of these policies by making offenders to face the law. Adetunji (2014) had earlier suggested that relevant agencies should sit up in their responsibilities and ensure maximum control of road traffic activities in Nigeria. Also, rail travel should be encouraged with the establishment of more rail lines across the federation of Nigeria to reduce pressure on the land transport companies. In addition, efficient transport management should be

encouraged in the industry. For instance, on the 20th of September 2017, the Governor of Delta State in Nigeria, Dr Ifeanyi Okowa, signed an Memorandum of Understanding(MOU) with the management of God is Good Motors Nigeria to manage Delta State Transport Company. This is a form of privatization of the public sector investment to foster efficiency and sustainability. Hence, most of the government-owned commercial transport companies suffer from poor maintenance culture and general management.

In conclusion, these recommendations would not only improve the standard of road transport travels in Nigeria and other developing countries but equally boost domestic tourism growth through sustained tourist traffic. There could also be easy movement of tourists and other travellers across Nigeria through intra and inter-state travels. This will transform domestic transportation in Nigeria into a pop-sock to tourism development and not a thistle to tourist safety as currently witnessed.

References

- Adeniji, K. (2000). Transport challenges in Nigeria in the next two decades. *Transport Studies Unit, Nigerian Institute of Social and Economic Research 1(3)*, 40-67.
- Aderamo, J.A. (2012). Assessing the trends in road traffic accident casualties on Nigeria roads. *Journal of Social Sciences 3*, 19-15.
- Adetunji, M.A. (2014). The level of compliance of commercial motorcyclists to traffic rules on urban roads in South western Nigeria. *Journal of Education and Social Research 4 (3)*, 345-351.
- Adiele, S.C.K. (2011). *An empirical investigation into Nigeria road accident causation factors*. Ibadan: University Press Ibadan.
- African Independent Television [AIT] (2017). FRSC road traffic reports. AIT 8pm News, September 23, 2017.
- Agbonkhese, O., Yisa, G.L., Agbonkhese, E.G., Akabi, D.O., Aka, E.O. and Mondigha, E.G. (2013), Road traffic accidents in Nigeria: Causes and prevention measures. *Civil and Environmental Research 3(13)*, 90-99.
- Ajiboye, A.O. and Afolayan, O. (2009). The impact of transportation in agricultural production in a developing country: A case of kolanut production in Nigeria. *International Journal of Agricultural Economics and Rural Development 2(2)*, 47-57.
- Aldona, J. And Grazvydas, J. (2007). Improvement of road safety using passive and active intelligent vehicle safety systems. *Journal of Road Safety 22(4)*, 284-289.
- Asalor, J.O. (2010). Towards improved road safety in Nigeria. Technical Report No: Rts/00/82/011, Faculty of Engineering, University of Benin.
- Atubi, A.O. (2009). Modelling road traffic accidents in Lagos State, South Western Nigeria. *Journal of Society and State 1(182)*, 57-74.
- Aworemi, J.R., Abdul-Azeez, I.A. and Olabode, S.O. (2010). Analytical study of the causal factors of road traffic crashes in South Western Nigeria. *Educational Research Journal 1(4)*, 118-124.
- Babatunde, J. (2014). Nigeria's Domestic Tourism Worth US & 4b – Sally Mbanefo. *Vanguard Newspaper*, June 13, 2014.

-
- Beck, L.F. and West, B.A. (2010). Vital signs: Nonfatal, motor vehicle-occupant injuries (2009) and seat belt use (2008) among adults – United States. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report*, 59(51), 1681-1685.
- Bell, J.L., Taylor, M.A., Chen, G.X., Kirk, R.D. and Leatherman, E.R. (2017). Evaluation of an In-Vehicle Monitoring System (IVMS) to reduce risky driving: Comparism of In-cab warning lights and supervisory coaching with videos of driving behaviour. *Journal of Safety Research*, 60, 125-136.
- Bello, Y.O and Bello, M.B. (2019). Destination attributes and domestic tourists' choice of Obudu Mountain Resort Calabar. *Journal of Tourism and Management Research* 4(3), 515-533
- Bhalla, K., Ezzati, M., Mahal, A., Salomon, J. And Reich, M. (2007). A risk-based method for modelling traffic fata cities. *Risk Analysis* 27, 125-136.
- Boal, W.L., Lij J. And Rodriquez-Acosta, R.L. (2016). Seat belt use among adult workers – 21 states, 2013. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report*, 65, 593-597.
- Boswan, S.M., Aitken, M.E., Helmkamp, J.C., Maham, S.A. and Graham, C.J. (2009). Impact of helmets on injuries of all-terrain vehicles. *Injury Prevention*, 15(1), 3-7.
- Burgus, S.K., Madsen, M.D., Sanderson, W.T. and Rautiainen, R.H. (2009). Youths Operating all terrain vehicle implications for safety education. *Journal of Agromedicine* 14(2), 97-104.
- Faajir, A. And Zidan, Z.H. (2016). An analysis of the issues and challenges of transportation in Nigeria and Egypt. *The Business and Management Review* 7(2), 18-29.
- Federal Government of Nigeria (2010). Draft National Transport Policy. www.nimasaibrary.com/PDFs/133219418698398.pdf
- Federal Office of Statistics (1999). *Annual Abstracts of Statistics*. Abuja: FOS
- Federal Republic of Nigeria Official Gazette (2012). National Road Traffic Regulations. www.https://frsc.gov.ng/National Road Traffic Regulations 2012.pdf
- Folagbade, A.M. (2015). An Assessment of the effectiveness of Federal Road Safety Commission in reducing road traffic accidents in Kaduna State. MSc Project, Ahmadu Bellow University Zaria, Nigeria.
- Friday, D. (2012). Modification of Road infrastructure to increase driver compliance in Uganda. *International Journal of Advances in Management and Economics* 1(3), 78-87.
- Gana, A.J. and Emmanuel, J.A. (2014). Road transportation and traffic law enforcement in Nigeria: A case study of the Federal Road Safety Corps (FRSC). *West African Journal of Industrial and Academic Research*, 11(1), 134-151.
- Isiaka, M.A. (2019). Socio-economic characteristics of domestic tourism consumers in Ibadan, Nigeria. *International Journal for Social Studies* 5(2), 52-68
- Jennissen, C.A., Harland, K.K., Wetjen, K., Hoogerwerf, P., O'Donnell, L. and Denning, G.M. (2017). All-terrain vehicle safety knowledge, riding behaviours and crash experience of farm progress show attendees. *Journal of Travel Research* 60, 71-78.
- Jeremiah, K. (2016). Improved traffic laws, compliance, key to children's safety. *The Guardian Newspaper*, March 4, 2016.
- Joewono, T.B. and Kubuta, H. (2006). Safety and security improvement in public transportation based on public perception in developing countries. *IATSS Research* 30 (1), 86-100.
- Kanafani, A. And Huang, J. (2010). Securing linked transportation systems: Economic implications and investment strategies. *Journal of Transport Security*, 3, 257-274.

-
- Kharola, P.S., Tiwari, G. and Mohan, D. (2010). Traffic, safety and city public transport system: Case study of Bengaluru, India. *Journal of Public Transportation* 13(4), 63-91.
- Kifworo, C., Okello, M. and Mopelu, I. (2020). Demographic profiling and domestic tourism participation behavior in Nairobi County, Kenya. *Journal of Tourism and Management Research* 7(2), 155-169
- Kimes, S. (2000). Yield management: An Overview. In U. McMaclion-Beattie, I.I. Yeoman and A. Ingold (eds), *Yield management strategies for the service industries*. 2nd Edition. London: Continuum.
- Kirillova, T., Zhilinkova, I., Golovkina, S. and Finko, A. (2021). The dynamic model for the sustainable development of the domestic tourism in the Russian Federation. E3S web of Conference 284, 10008, 2-8.
- Koller, S.M., Hardmeier, D., Michel, S. And Schiavaninger, A. (2008). Investigating training, transfer and viewpoint effects resulting from recurrent CBT of X-ray image interpretation. *Journal of Transport Security*, 1, 81-106.
- Ladan, S.I. (2012). An analysis of air transportation in Nigeria. *JORIND* 10(2), 230-237.
- Ladan, S.I. (2013). Land transport in fostering national integration in Nigeria. *JORIND* 11(20), 231-239.
- Macha, L.J. (2021). Tanzania citizens' participation in domestic tourism: The trust on destination visit. *International Journal for Innovation Education and Research* 9(6), 209-236.
- Mohan, D. (2002). Planning for safety in high capacity buse system. In G. Tiwari (ed), *Urban transport for growing cities: High capacity bus systems*. New Delhi: Macmillian Indian Ltd. p. 42-56.
- Mohan, D. (2004). The road ahead: Traffic injuries and fatalities in India. *Transportation Research and Injury Prevention Programme (TRIPP)*. A publication of Indian Institute for Technology, Delhi.
- Mohan, D. (2011). Analysis of road traffic fatality Data for Asia. *Journal of the Eastern Asia Society for Transport Studies* 9, 1786-1795.
- Mohan, D. (2013). Safety of children as motorcycle passengers. Proceedings of the Eastern Design society for transportation studies. Vol 9.
- Mokhefi, A., Hamoul, T. and Sawsan, B. (2017). Strategic management of the domestic tourism: The first step for a successful Algerian Tourism Sector. *International Journal of Research Science and Management* 4(12), 94-102
- Nwankwo, E.A. (2017). *Fundamentals of tourism studies*. Nsukka; University of Nigeria Press Ltd.
- O'Neill, B. and Mohan, D. (2002). Reducing motor vehicle crash deaths and injuries in newly motorising countries. *BMJ* vol 324, 1142-1145.
- Odugbemi, O.O. (2010). *Road transportation and tourism in Nigeria*. Lagos: Joja press.
- Ogbonna, C.O., Ibe, P.E. and Ikegwu, E.M. (2018). Promotional strategies of domestic tourism in Lagos State Nigeria: Practices, Problems and Prospects. *Humanities, Management, Arts, Education & the Social Sciences Journal* 6(3), 45-57
- Ojo, D. (2017). NTDC to focus on domestic tourism with Tour Nigeria. *Thisday Newspaper* July 2, 2017.
- Okpoko, A.I. and Okpoko, P.U. (2002). *Tourism in Nigeria*. Nsukka: Afro Orbis Publishers
- Olaitan, O. (2017). NTDC, NANTA partner to promote domestic tourism in Nigeria. *Tribune Newspaper* July 12, 2017.

- Olamigoke, E.A. and Emmanuel, A.A. (2013). The role of road transportation in local economic development: A focus on Nigerian transportation system. *Developing Country Studies* 3(6), 46-52.
- Olubomehin, O.O. (2012). Road transportation as lifeline of the economy in western Nigeria, 1920-1952. *African Journal of History and Culture* 4(3), 37-45.
- Oni, S.I. and Okanlawon, K.R. (2010). Transportation education in Nigeria. In Ikwuayo, P. (ed), *Exploring the multifaceted dimensions in exercise and sports psychology*. Ibadan: Olu-Akia publishers. Pp. 106-118.
- Onuoha, G. (2012). Contemporary Igbo Nationalism and the Crisis of Self-Determination in Nigeria. *African Studies*, 71 (1), 29-51.
- Oruonye, E.D. and Ahmed, Y.M. (2020). An appraisal of the potential impacts of COVID-19 on tourism in Nigeria. *Journal of Economics and Technology Research* 1(1), 32-41
- Oyadiran, P.A. and Aregbesola, A.M. (2008). Road transport policy and traffic management in Nigeria. *Journal of Research in National Development* 6(1), 21-21
- Page, S.J. (2009). *Transport and Tourism : Global perspectives*. England: Pearson Education United.
- Rodgers, G.B. (2008). Factors associated with all-terrain vehicle mortality rate in the United States: An analysis of state-level data. *Accident Analysis and Prevention*, 40(2), 725-732.
- Rodrigue, J.P. (2013). *The geography of the transport system*. 3rd Edition. London: Rutledge
- Salminen, S. (1995). Does pressure from work community increase risk taking? *Psychological Reports* 77, 1247-1250.
- Salminen, S. And Lahdeniemi, E. (2002). Risk factors in work-related traffic. *Transportation Research Part F5*, 77-86.
- Skare, M. Soriano, D.R. and Porada-Rochon, M. (2021). Impact of COVID-19 on the travel and tourism industry. *Technological Forecasting & Social Change* 163(2021), 2-14
- Straddling, S. and Anable, J. (2008). Individual transport patterns. In R.D. Knowles, J. Show and I. Docherty (eds), *Transport geographies: Mobilities, flows and spaces*. Oxford: Blackwell, 179-195.
- Sumaila, A.F. (2013). Building sustainable policy framework for transport development. A review of National Transport Policy Initiatives in Nigeria 2(2), 505-520.
- Sumaila, A.F. (2013). Road crashes: trends and safety management in Nigeria. *Journal of Geographyc and Regional Planning* 6 (3), 53-62.
- Summala, H. (1988). Risk control is not risk adjustment: The Zero-Risk Theory of Driver behaviour and its implications. *Ergonomics* 31 (4), 491-506.
- Tolley, R.S. and Turton, B.J. (1995). *Transport systems policy and planning: A geographical approach*. Essex: Longman Scientific and Technical
- Tunde, A.G., Taiwo, O.A. and Matanmi, O.G. (2012). Compliance with Road safety regulations among commercial motorcyclists in Nigeria. *Canadian Social Science* 8(1), 92-100.
- Ugboaja, P.C. (2013). A sustainable assessment of Nigerian Transport Policy. *International Journal of Asian Social Sciences* 3(5), 1208-1226.
- Ugur, N. and Akbiyik, A. (2020). Impact of COVID-19 on global tourism industry: A cross-regional comparism. *Tourism Management Perspectives* 36(2020), 1-13.
- Wilson, F.A. and Stimpson, J.P. (2010). Trends in fatalities from distracted driving in the United States, 1999-2008. *American Journal of Public Health*, 100, 2213-22-9.

=====

Wu, K.F., Ageuro-Valverde, J. And Jovanis, P.P. (2014). Using naturalistic driving data explore the association between traffic-related events and crash risk at the driver level. *Accident Analysis and prevention*, 72, 210-218.

Wu, Y. And Li, X. (1999). Targeting sustainable development for urban transport. Workshop on Urban Transport and environment, CICED, Beijing.